

1 **2.10 Wind Turbine Zoning**

2 **2.10.1 Purpose**

3 This ordinance provides a framework for siting, construction, and operation of a wind energy
4 facility in the County that will preserve the safety and well being of the residents and facilitate
5 equitable and orderly development.

6 **2.10.2 Regulatory Framework**

7 A wind energy facility may only be constructed in the County if the applicant first obtains a
8 permit and complies with the conditions of this ordinance.

9 **2.10.3 Applicability**

10 The requirements of this ordinance apply to a wind energy facility, or any portion of one, erected
11 in this county after the effective date of this ordinance if the facility contains any wind turbine
12 rated at 100 kilowatts or more nameplate capacity.

13 **2.10.4 Definitions**

14 “adjoining land” is real property that has a different owner than the host property and is either,
15 contiguous to the host property at any point or segment, or is separated from the host property by
16 an intervening fee simple interest that is less than 2RD.

17 “airstrip” is a takeoff and landing area for fixed wing aircraft, whether publicly or privately
18 owned, that was given an FAA numerical designation sometime before 1 March 2009.

19 “applicant” is a person who filed an application for a conditional use permit.

20 “facility owner” means the person(s) having an equity interest in the wind energy facility.

21 “feeder lines” are power lines between a wind energy facility’s collector stations or substations
22 and the region’s high voltage transmission lines.

23 “gross weight” means the weight of a vehicle without a load plus the weight of any load on it.

24 “host property” is the very lot on which a wind turbine is located. A wind energy facility may
25 contain several host properties. The fact that adjoining properties having various respective
26 owners are covered by related options, leases, or easements to a single facility owner does not
27 cause the various land owners to be a single host property. Each parcel containing a turbine is a
28 host property even if an abutting property belonging to another party contains a turbine belonging
29 to the same facility owner.

30 “hub height” means the distance measured from the surface of the tower foundation to the height
31 of the axis of the wind turbine hub.

32 “MET tower” means a meteorological structure used to collect data on wind and or weather
33 conditions.

34 “occupied structure” is man made shelter in which people either live, meet, conduct business, or
35 gather, in addition it includes but is not limited to a residence, dwelling, apartment house,
36 condominium, residential subdivision platted and recorded under NDCC 11-33.2 its predecessor
37 or successor law, a townsite, addition or subdivision platted and recorded under NDCC 40-50.1
38 its predecessor or successor law, or residential setting; any structure open to the public for
39 business that regularly conducts business including but not limited to a hotel, motel,
40 campground, mall, school, hospital, church, public library, store, airstrip, manufacturing facility,
41 or sport venue; or other structure that is either legally inhabited, in use or under substantial
42 construction (e.g. surface has been improved in preparation for construction) at the time the
43 permit application is submitted for use as one of the above.

44 “operator” means the person responsible for the day-to-day operation and maintenance of a wind
45 energy facility. A facility owner may contract with or hire a person to operate it.

46 “permittee” is the person holding the conditional use permit. Permittee may include the
47 subsidiaries, agents, subcontractors, independent contractors, and employees of the person
48 holding the permit; i.e. for purposes of liability for road damage caused in erection or
49 maintenance.

50 "person" means an individual, partnership, joint venture, private or public corporation,
51 association, firm, public service company, cooperative, political subdivision, municipal
52 corporation, government agency, public utility district, or any other entity, public or private,
53 however organized.

54 “public road” means every way or place generally open to vehicle travel, even though it may be
55 temporarily closed or subject to restricted travel due to construction, reconstruction, repair, or
56 maintenance. 57-43.1-01. A section line is a public road. 24-07-03.

57 “RD” is an abbreviation for “rotor diameter” which is the distance of a line segment that bisects
58 the center of the hub and terminates at the circle that encompasses the tips of each rotor blade
59 that are farthest from the hub. For example, “2RD” means a distance equal to two times the rotor
60 diameter or four times the radius and on a turbine with rotor blades 70 meters (229.6 feet) long
61 (measured from the center of the hub) the rotor diameter will be 140 meters (459.2 feet).

62 “site” is a contiguous tract or group of parcels for which one operator and/or facility owner or a
63 group acting in concert has option agreements, easements, and/or leases acquired to operate a
64 turbine, wind energy facility or accessory thereto.

65 “site perimeter” is the outside boundary of the contiguous parcels all having either an option,
66 easement, and/or lease agreement for a wind energy facility accessory to the same facility owner.

67 “turbine height” means the distance measured from the ground level surface of the tower
68 foundation to the highest point of the turbine rotor plane.

69 A “wind turbine” [also known herein as turbine] captures kinetic energy from the wind to drive
70 an electrical generator. Its typical components include blades, tower, accelerator platform or
71 nacelle body.

72 “wind energy facility” means an electric generating facility, the main mechanical or electrical
73 purpose of which is to supply electricity. It consists of one or more wind turbine and other
74 accessory structures and buildings, including substations, meteorological towers, electrical
75 infrastructure, transmission lines and other appurtenant structures and facilities.

76 **2.10.5 County Zoning Administrator**

77 Wind turbine zoning shall be administered by the County Board with supervisory assistance from
78 the County Zoning and Planning Commission, the County Zoning Administrator, and
79 supplemental assistance from other county departments. The Zoning Administrator shall have
80 the following duties.

- 81 (A) Conduct preliminary administrative review of each permit application, variance
82 request, and other information as required by this Ordinance and forward
83 recommendations for disposition to County Zoning and Planning Commission or the
84 County Board.
- 85 (B) Schedule meetings and hearings that are required by law or by this ordinance,
86 providing notice to the board members, the press, and the party who sought the
87 hearing.
- 88 (C) If there is cause to believe work is being done or a condition exists that is contrary to
89 the provisions of this Ordinance, the Zoning Administrator shall in his discretion
90 decide whether to investigate personally or with the assistance of the Sheriff’s office
91 and whether to recommend to the County Planning and Zoning Commission that a stop
92 work order be issued. Any stop work order shall be served upon the owner and/or
93 operator in accord with the provisions of Rule 4 of the North Dakota Rules of Civil
94 Procedure, service upon the permittee’s named agent for service of process is
95 satisfactory.
- 96 (D) Mail notice of authorization to proceed to the owner and/or operator after the County
97 Planning and Zoning Commission has determined that a violation of this Ordinance,
98 for which a stop work order was issued, has been remedied.
- 99 (E) Conduct in depth appraisal of applications for conditional use or variances to ensure
100 they satisfy the criteria for the benefit sought.
- 101 (F) Mail any permit issued by the Planning and Zoning Commission to the facility owner.
- 102 (G) Maintain records and permits as required by this Ordinance. Any records required to
103 be maintained by the State shall be provided by the Zoning Administrator upon
104 request.
- 105 (H) Provide open records to requesters concerning this Ordinance in accord with the open

106 records law.
 107 (I) Inspect wind energy facilities to insure compliance with the standards of this
 108 Ordinance. The Zoning Administrator is to rely on the Sheriff's office and its trained
 109 investigators for detailed investigations. The Zoning Administrator should consider
 110 requesting the Sheriff's assistance if there is cause to believe there is a violation of this
 111 ordinance that may require issue of a stop work notice.

112 **2.10.6 Conditional Use Permit Availability by Zone**

113 A wind energy facility or part of one will be conditionally permitted or not permitted based on
 114 the generating capacity and land use district as established in the table below

115 zoning district	not permitted	conditional use permitted
116 agricultural (A)		yes
117 rural residential zone (RR)		yes
118 residential community zone (RC)		yes
119 commercial zone (C)		yes
120 industrial zone (I)		yes
121 recreational/open space zone (R/O)		yes

122 **2.10.7 Conditional Use Permit Application Process**

123 Work may commence to construct a wind energy facility only after a county conditional use
 124 permit has been issued by the County Board. This does not preclude wind monitoring, soil
 125 testing, or survey work prior to obtaining a permit, however, even prior to applying for or
 126 receiving a conditional use permit for a wind energy facility, MET towers must be marked with
 127 high visibility balls and flags and painted according to this ordinance.

128 A permit application must be submitted to the County Zoning Administrator, at the Stutsman
 129 County Auditor's office. Each application must be signed by a representative of the prospective
 130 permittee who is authorized to contractually bind the person. An application must include the
 131 following.

- 132 (A) A check or money order for the full amount of permit fees calculated at the rate of
 133 \$500 per turbine.
- 134 (B) The name, business address and phone number of the person in whose name the permit
 135 is to be issued and if the authorized agent for service of process is different than the
 136 permit holder, the name and North Dakota address of the agent of the person
 137 authorized to receive service of process on the person's behalf.
- 138 (C) Evidence of the applicant's capacity to contractually bind the person seeking the
 139 permit and authority to make binding representations on the person's behalf to
 140 municipalities for purposes of zoning, siting, and construction of a wind energy

- 141 facility.
- 142 (D) A schedule for the proposed start and completion of construction of the facility which
143 includes the applicants proposal for final repairs to public roads.
- 144 (E) The applicant shall include in the application information describing the applicant's
145 property rights within the boundaries of the proposed site.
- 146 (F) The applicant shall provide a registered professional engineer's report as described
147 below in road protection.
- 148 (G) A USGS topographical map of the wind energy facility and 1,320 feet of adjoining
149 land, non-participating land, contiguous with any proposed host property. The
150 following shall be clearly marked on the map:
- 151 (1) each existing: wind turbine, wind energy facility fixture, regardless of ownership,
152 accessory structure or building, including substation, meteorological tower,
153 electrical infrastructure, and collector line or transmission line;
 - 154 (2) each of the applicant's proposed improvements for the wind energy facility or
155 accessory structure or building, including each wind turbine, MET tower,
156 electrical line, and access road;
 - 157 (3) each occupied structure, improvement, public road, private road, utility line,
158 public facility;
 - 159 (4) all section lines and any boundaries between abutting parcels, tracts, or lots owned
160 by different parties;
 - 161 (5) boundaries of any easement for a section line, public road, highway, that is within
162 5RD of any envisioned or probable wind turbine site;
 - 163 (6) boundaries of any filed lease, easement, or option for wind energy facilities,
164 whether they benefit the applicant, the applicant's probable operator, or an
165 unrelated party;
 - 166 (7) the site boundary;
 - 167 (8) each public or private airstrip with FAA identification number, see
168 http://www.faa.gov/airports_airtraffic/airports/airport_safety/airportdata_5010/;
 - 169 (9) natural terrain features; and
 - 170 (10) either noted on the map and/or via a key, the names of the property owners inside
171 the site and of the property owners for adjoining land.

172 **2.10.8 Public Hearing**

173 After receipt of the application, the Zoning Commission will review the application and will hold
174 at least an initial public hearing on the application within 45 days of receiving the application.
175 The Zoning Administrator shall publish notice of the meeting in the official newspaper of the
176 County at least 14 days prior to the hearing.

177 **2.10.9 Deliberation and Decision**

178 If the Zoning Commission finds that the application satisfies the application criteria and is
179 satisfied the prospective permittee will satisfy the conditions in this ordinance, then it shall issue
180 a conditional use permit within 15 days of making that finding. The County Board stands as the
181 Board of Adjustment and Appeals.

182 **2.10.10 Demonstration of Compliance**

183 The Permit issued pursuant to the this ordinance is conditioned on the Permittee’s final
184 demonstration of compliance with the requirements of the ordinance following completion of
185 construction of the facility. Within 90 days of facility construction completion, the Permittee
186 shall submit to the Zoning Commission an updated and final USGS topographical map, or survey
187 if available, providing all information pursuant to 2.10.7 and demonstrating actual compliance
188 with the requirements and conditions of the Permit.

189 **2.10.11 Appearance, Lighting, Sound, Agricultural Operations, Roads, and Power Lines**

- 190 (1) Wind turbines shall be painted a non-reflective coating and in a non-obtrusive color.
- 191 (2) Turbines shall not display any advertising.
- 192 (3) Each turbine will be marked with an identification number large enough to assist
193 identification of the turbine number in an emergency.
- 194 (4) Turbines are to be lighted to the extent advised by the FAA in FAA Advisory Circulars
195 47 CFR §§ 17.21-17.58 or their successors.
- 196 (5) At wind energy facilities, the location and construction of access roads and other
197 infrastructure shall, to the extent reasonably possible, not disrupt farming, agricultural
198 operations, or the landscape. In order to preserve the integrity of fields and capacity
199 for efficient tilling, planting, and harvesting, access roads should be built parallel or
200 perpendicular to existing roads, not diagonally across fields for mere convenience of
201 the shortest route to a turbine.
- 202 (6) The Permittee shall promptly replace or repair all fences or gates removed or damaged
203 during all phases of the Wind Energy Facility’s life, unless otherwise negotiated with
204 the affected landowner. When the Permittee installs a gate where electric fences are
205 present, the Permittee shall provide for continuity in the electric fence circuit.
- 206 (7) The Permittee shall place electrical lines, known as collectors, and communication
207 cables underground when located on private property, unless the Permittee either first
208 obtains a waiver from the private land owner and the Permittee provides clear and
209 convincing evidence to the Planning and Zoning Commission that satisfies the
210 Permittee’s heavy burden of proving there are either geographic and/or geologic
211 conditions present that make underground location impossible, impractical or
212 infeasible, in which case a variance would be granted. Similarly, where the Permittee
213 obtains a waiver from the landowner and can show by clear and convincing evidence
214 presented to the Planning and Zoning Commission that the physics of conductivity will
215 cause such a power loss due to transmitting over such a long distance underground, a
216 variance will be granted. Use of the public right of way must be in compliance with
217 the associated governing body’s criteria for use. Collectors and cables shall also be
218 placed within or adjacent to the land necessary for wind turbine access roads, unless
219 otherwise negotiated with the affected landowner. Feeder lines are excepted from the
220 requirements in this paragraph.
- 221 (8) The Permittee shall place overhead feeder lines on public rights-of-way, if a public
222 right-of-way exists, or the Permittee may place feeder lines on private property. A
223 change of routes may be made as long as the feeder remains on public right of way and

- 224 approval has been obtained from the government responsible for the affected right-of-
225 way. When placing a feeder on private property, the Permittee shall place the feeder in
226 accordance with the easement negotiated with the affected landowner.
- 227 (9) MET towers 100 feet or more tall must be marked in a way that satisfies FAA advice
228 set out in FAA Advisory Circulars 47 CFR §§ 17.21-17.58 or their successors.
229 <http://wireless.fcc.gov/antenna/documentation/faadocs/7460-1K.pdf> The drafters of
230 this ordinance understand perfectly well that the FAA only requires painting for
231 towers 200' or taller. Those who erect, maintain, own or operate a MET tower in
232 Stutsman County that is 100 feet or taller must apply the advice, methods and guidance
233 in the FAA circulars to any tower 100 feet or higher. Neither an environmental
234 statement nor assessment is required. In lieu of lighting, using the following
235 combination of balls, flags, and sleeves is allowed.
- 236 (a) One high visibility cable ball at least 21" (53cm) in diameter on each outer guy-
237 wire placed at about half the height of the MET tower;
 - 238 (b) four high visibility flags at least 24" x 12" (78cm x 40cm) on each outer guy-wire
239 placed at intervals that segment the guy wire evenly;
 - 240 (c) high visibility sleeves, one per each anchor and one installed at 26 feet or (7.93m)
241 height on each of the guy wires.
- 242 (10) This ordinance adopts EPA guidelines on noise levels. The guidelines are contained in
243 the EPA publication, *Information on Levels of Environmental Noise Requisite to*
244 *Protect Public Health and Welfare With an Adequate Margin Of Safety*. Operation of
245 the wind energy facility must not cause any EPA level for activity interference or
246 hearing loss to be exceeded either inside or within 50 feet of an occupied structure.

247 **2.10.12 Setbacks**

248 These setbacks apply to all wind turbines in a wind energy facility.

249 Setbacks are measured from the vertical or nearly vertical surface of the wind turbine's tower at
250 ground level to the closest near vertical surface of the occupied or unoccupied structure,
251 improvement, or the nearest point of a boundary, bridge, line, or the center line of the improved
252 surface of a road or airstrip.

- 253 (1) Each wind turbine must be set back at least 5RD from any **occupied structure**.
- 254 (2) Each wind turbine must be set back at least 1.1 times the turbine height from any:
255 public road or bridge; rail line; above ground electrical or communication line.
256 Turbines must be set back at least 1.1 times the turbine height from each antenna,
257 tower, unoccupied structure, or improvement with an estimated value over \$25,000.
258 The Planning and Zoning Commission can estimate the value without appraisal, but
259 interested parties may timely submit an appraisal.
- 260 (3) Each wind turbine must be set back at least 2RD from the boundary between the host
261 property and any property that adjoins the host property. Public roads are excepted
262 from this 2RD setback requirement but have an applicable setback above.

263 **2.10.12A Variance to Setback**
264 A Variance to a setback related to private property may be granted if the Permittee and the
265 affected party sign a waiver agreement.

266 The Planning and Zoning Commission may issue a variance from a set back requirement
267 regarding an occupied structure if that structure has not been used as an occupied structure in a
268 year or more prior to submission of the permit application or request for variance. The act of
269 providing this particular example of one reason a variance to a setback can be issued does not
270 limit the Commission to issuing variances for only that reason.

271 **2.10.12B Notice of hearing on application for variance to a setback**

272 It is the obligation of the party seeking the variance to the setback requirement to serve notice of
273 the initial hearing on the application, in accord with the ND Rules of Civil Procedure, to all
274 property owners land located inside the setback area sought to be diminished. Proof of service
275 must be filed with the Zoning Commission prior to the hearing. The Zoning Commission can
276 authorize notice by publication according to the Rules of Civil Procedure.

277 **2.10.12C Waiver of Setback**

278 Where the provisions for variances on wind turbines differs from the general variance provision
279 in section 4.5 of this ordinance, this wind turbine's special provision governs for wind turbine
280 issues.

281 A permit applicant, permittee, or host property owner may apply for a variance from a setback
282 requirement involving an occupied structure, unoccupied structure, improvement, antenna, tower,
283 road, or bridge.

284 **2.10.12D Contents of setback waiver**

285 The party seeking the variance from the setback must attempt to obtain from the effected
286 property owner and should provide to the Planning and Zoning Commission a waiver executed
287 by each affected owner sought to be removed from the applicable setback protection. The waiver
288 should be for a period of time equal to or greater than the greatest period of time granted to the
289 operator in the lease, easement, option or the greatest combination thereof given by the host
290 property owner.

291 The setback waiver signed by the effected property owner must contain a notice to the property
292 owner of the setback required by this ordinance, describe how the proposed wind turbine location
293 is not in compliance with the setback, and clearly state that consent is granted for the wind
294 turbine or accessory to be closer to the owner's property than allowed by the ordinance. The
295 waiver must also contain the following notice.

296 A wind turbine absorbs energy from a stream of wind. Once the stream of wind
297 passes through the rotors of a turbine, it loses energy, becomes disarrayed, and
298 until the wake is calmed and the stream reinvigorated, is less useful to another

299 turbine set up down wind from the first. Wind wakes can extend more than 5
300 rotor diameters down wind from a turbine. So, if your neighbor has a turbine up
301 wind from you and within 5 rotor diameters of your boundary, it will probably be
302 unfeasible for you to place a turbine on your property close to the boundary in the
303 wake of your neighbor's turbine. To protect you from having a neighbor and a
304 power company place a turbine so close to your property that it saps the potency
305 of the wind before it arrives over your land, Stutsman County passed a setback
306 requiring all turbines to be placed at least two rotor diameters (2RD) from any
307 property boundary. You may waive that setback protection. You may want to
308 strike an agreement with a neighbor and a power company that gives you a part of
309 the proceeds of the turbine in exchange for allowing your neighbor to place the
310 turbine less than 2RD from your property. You may wish to charge the neighbor
311 or the power company for your waiver. You probably ought to contact a private
312 attorney before you sign a setback waiver.

313 **2.10.12E Required Dignities of Valid Variance**

314 A setback variance is only valid if granted by duly passed motion of the Planning and Zoning
315 Commission, issued in writing, and signed by either the chairman of the Planning and Zoning
316 Commission or the Zoning Administrator.

317 **2.10.13 Minimum Ground Clearance**

318 The blade tip of any Wind Turbine shall, at its lowest point, have ground clearance of no less
319 than seventy-five (75) feet.

320 **2.10.14 Restoration of Property**

321 Within one hundred and eighty (180) days of termination or abandonment of leases or easements
322 for a wind energy facility in the County, the Permittee shall cause, at its expense, removal of all
323 structures to a depth of three feet below preconstruction grade.

324 **2.10.17 Road Protection**

325 The permittee is responsible for abiding by the State and local overweight load permitting
326 process. See NDCC chapter 39-12 and Stutsman County Highway Department (701) 252-9040.
327 A conditional use permit issued under this ordinance to erect a wind energy facility does not
328 negate a hauler's obligation to obtain an overweight load permit prior to hauling.

329 Any road damage caused by the permittee, its independent contractor, employee, agent,
330 contractor, or subcontractor shall be promptly repaired at the permittee's expense to current
331 standards set out in the NDDOT's Standard Specifications for Road and Bridge Construction.
332 <http://www.dot.nd.gov/dotnet/supplspecs/StandardSpecs.aspx> . If it reasonably foreseeable that
333 continued trips will make prompt repair to this standard absurd, then intermediary measures must
334 be taken by the operator , if approved by the political subdivision in charge of the road, to ensure
335 the public road remains passable and useable as has been the tradition in the community. Final
336 repairs to these standards must be made promptly after the completion of the construction of the

337 wind energy facility.

338 **Engineer's Report**

339 The applicant shall identify, by map, each public road in Stutsman County that the permittee may
340 or will travel on with a gross weight of over 80,000 lbs.

341 The Applicant will at its own expense, supply to the County both a pre and post-
342 construction/haul inspections. The reports must be approved by a civil engineer registered as a
343 professional engineer under NDCC chapter 43-19.1. The report shall use objectively verifiable,
344 generally accepted means of testing to catalogue the condition of any public road or bridge in
345 Stutsman County that the permittee may or will use to carry, cross, or traverse with a gross
346 weight over 80,000 lbs.

347 The report will describe the gross weights the permittee anticipates running for certain classes of
348 jobs; a rough estimate of the number of extreme (over 150,000 lbs) gross weight trips; what
349 general damage or wear the engineer expects to see; and what places the engineer expects to see
350 the pavement entirely fail.

351 Both the pre-haul inspection and the post haul inspection must address the following.

- 352 1. Video recording of the haul road(s) from start to finish taken from a vehicle driven at 25
353 mph.
- 354 2. Use straight edge to check for rutting every 0.10 miles.
- 355 3. Use still photography with notations re location and length to record breakups and yielding
356 aka alligator aka checkerboard.
- 357 4. Record round (steel) and joint alignment (concrete) on major centerline culverts.
- 358 5. Record width of traveled way and depth of pavement or gravel every 0.10 miles.

359 Any damage caused or thought to be exacerbated by the permittee's loads or work that has not
360 been repaired or remedied at the time of the report will be identified and a time line for repairing
361 each will be identified along with an explanation of the repair or replacement proposed.

362 **2.10.15 Transfer of Wind Energy Facility Siting Permit**

363 In the event of a change in ownership or controlling interest in a wind energy facility and the
364 transfer of the Permit, any successors and assigns of the original Permittee must agree to abide by
365 and comply with the requirements and conditions of the Permit for the duration of operation of a
366 wind energy facility permitted in the County, or give notice of intent to not honor it and forfeit
367 the permit and its rights. Within thirty (30) days of such change in ownership or controlling
368 interest of any entity owning a wind energy facility, the Permittee shall notify the County Zoning
369 Administrator aka County Auditor. If the new entity has a different agent for service of process
370 in the state, then the new agent's address and name need to be provided at the same time. A
371 change of ownership that results in either inability, unwillingness, or failure to abide by the
372 conditions of this ordinance can be a basis for revocation of the permit.